

The impact of doctor-patient relationship & communication (on mastectomy rates)

Professor Malcolm W Reed Department of Oncology, The University of Sheffield



What is the standard of care for early operable breast cancer?





16/02/2012 © The University of Sheffield



BCS



Better body image

? Better health related quality of life

Mastectomy

Radiotherapy not integral to treatment Simpler treatment package Lower local recurrence rates

Survival is equal

Risk of reoperation for margins Radiotherapy integral to treatment Higher local recurrence rates

Breast loss

Body image worse

Sexuality worse





Variation in UK surgeons' mastectomy rates



BCCOM Project Year 3: The management of primary breast cancers diagnosed in 2004 in the UK



Variations in locoregional therapy in postmenopausal patients with early breast cancer treated in different countries

J. G. H. van Nes¹, C. Seynaeve³, S. Jones⁴, C. Markopoulos⁵, H. Putter² and C. J. H. van de Velde¹ on behalf of the Tamoxifen and Exemestane Adjuvant Multinational (TEAM) trialists



BJS 2010; 97: 671-9

Volur	CAL CARE 4 (I, Number 3, pp 181-189 Lippinxott Williams & Wilkins, Inc.	- 25	tenatoral jound for Quality in Fina	th Coll 2002; Volume 14,	Number 5: 411-410]		Original ar	ticle
Persistent Differences in Sociodemographic Determinants of Breast Conserving Treatment Despite Overall Increased Adoption			A first look at variations in use of breast conserving surgery at five teaching					The National Health Service Breast Screening Programme and British Association of Surgical Oncology audit of quality assurance in breast screening 1996–2001		
	HEALTH SERVICES RESEARCH	┷┷┓┣	nospitals	in Japa	an					
1	RECHERCHE EN SERVICES DE SOINS DE SANTÉ	т	-	UICHI IMANAK	IANAKA, MASAHIRO HIROSE, KAZUAKI KUWABARA, TOSHIO OGAWA			۲	Pergamon	J Clin Fajienel Vol 48, No. 3, pp. 345-332, 1995 0895-4356(94)00148-0 Printed in Great Britisin. All rights reserved pathan 0895-4356,95 59, 59, 00 Blemingham B15 21T,
B mer abil	Variation in breast cancer surgery in Ontario	-	ANZ J. Surg. 2006			doi: 10.111	11/j.1445-2197.2006	6.03917.x		e of Ived
Va	Pergamon International Journal for Quality in Health Care, Vol. 6, No. 3, pp. 233-238 Bereits Scene Proprint Scene 1353-45865(94)00031-X iation in Use of Breast Surgery and Characteristics	d no Sinth M	etu tain	SCREE D	RURAL DIFFERENCE	S IN THE MANAGEMEN VE BREAST CANCER A I <i>N SITU</i> IN VICTORIA			TREATME EXCELLE	IATENESS AND VARIATION OF SURGICAL SO INT OF BREAST CANCER IN ITALY: WHEN ENCE IN CLINICAL RESEARCH DOES NOT "ITH GENERALIZED GOOD QUALITY CARE don IGLIONE' A NICOLICCI' B GBULL'C ANCIONNE
Ho	Hospitals' Surgical Staff		Alesa DAVID	L. Kok,* Jiu	Original article					IGLIONE, ¹ A. NICOLUCCI, ¹ R. GRILLI, ² C. ANGIOLINI, ² for h ¹ F. CARINCI, ¹ D. CUBASSO, ¹ G. FILARDO, ² D. LABBROZZI ¹
Anto Angi Mau	Trends in Breast Conserving Surgery Among Asian Americans and PC Robert Antoni Islanders, 1992-2000 Mita Sanghavi Goel, MD, MPH, ¹ Risa B. Burns, MD, ² Russell S. Phillips, MD, ² MANUEZ Roger B. Davis, ScD, ² Quyen Ngo-Metzger, MD, MPH, ³ Ellen P. McCarthy, P Ublian of General International Internationa Internatintereformation Internationa International International			*School of Mea Centre for Wom partment of Hu d: At least one this study was to	Variations in locoregional therapy in postmenopausal p with early breast cancer treated in different countries J. G. H. van Nes ¹ , C. Seynaeve ³ , S. Jones ⁴ , C. Markopoulos ⁵ , H. Putter ² and C. J. H. va on behalf of the Tamoxifen and Exemestane Adjuvant Multinational (TEAM) trialists			tries C. J. H. va trialists	n de Velde ¹	Regional Differences in Surgical Management of Breast Cancer
*Labo Riche Italy	² Division of General Medicine and Pimary Care. Department of Medicine. Beth target Decores School. Baston, MA, USA- ³ Division of General Medicine and Pimary Care and the Health Policy I Infine College of Medicine. Invine, CA, USA.	iarvard Medical wersity of California	reastScreen Vic An analysis of nducted. Descri c regression wa nfounding factor	Departments of "Surgery and "Medical Statistics, Leiden University Medical Center, Leiden, and "Department of Medical Oncolog Centre - Daniel den Hoed Cancer Center, Resertiant, The Netherlands, "Trace Noncology, Dallas, and US Oncology Research, H and "Brease Unit, Adhens University Medical School, University of Ahlens, Adhens, Greece Carrenguadane at: Professor C. J. H. van de Velde, Leiden University Medical Center, Department of Surgery, Kd-R, PO Box 9600, ; Netherlands (e-mail: c.j.k.va., dzvelde@flume.al)			y Research, Ho	uston, Texas, USA,	Hobert I. Usteen, MU Glenn D. Steele, Jr., MD Herman R. Menck, CPh David P. Winchester, MD	
‡Uniti Negri- Obj chara predi	women will not receive the procedure. Work will be not receive the procedure of the procedure o	t of early-stag ossible. ¹ For we BCS has equive treatment ² and cual function. ³ as in the use characteristic	ge (i.e., stage I or II) omen diagnosed with alent survival to mas- d may afford women Despite these guide- of BCS exist by geo- cs including race/	tural women w rn (odds ratio, 0 s ratio, 0.53; 959 mour size, surg use of BCS for s: Among Vic ith rural women	al women w odds ratio, 0 io, 0.33; 95 Background: The Tamoxifen and Exemestane Adjuvant Mukinational (TEAM) trial is an ir of BCS for large number of patients already recruited offered the opportunity to explore locoregiona Among Vie					In an effort to investigate possible regional mastectomy began in some centers earlier, variations in the treatment of breast cancer, it was not until the 1980s that large random- the 1988 National Cancer Data Base ized studies established the principle that, (NCDB) data for nine regions of the coun- in certain circumstances, partial mastec-
We ar more portio staff. level patier <i>Desig</i> sonal geons concu taken conse servat	I et ll brost caser from 1992 to 2000 in the Surveillance, Rademi, edug, and Ed Benale pagema olag, and Ed Benale pagema (alga, and Ed Benale pagema). The surveillance, Rademi of stage 1 of Brosst surveillance, Rademi MAM RESLTS Overall, ANP somen had lower rates of DCS thin there marked DES also 13bond ANP somen had power rates of DCS thin the surveillance and the surveillance and the surveillance and the surveillance of stage 1 of Brosst surveillance, ANP somen had power rates of DCS thin the surveillance receipts status, for sign the surveillance and the surveillance and the surveillance and the surveillance receipts status. Some rades to the surveillance and the surveillance receipts status, for sign born ANP somen had power and surveillance and for the surveillance and the surveillance and the surveillance and the surveillance receipts status. Surveillance and the surveillance and the surveillance and the surveillance receipts being ANP somen had power and surveillance and the surveillance an	e demonstratee sian American found that AAF less likely to re Other studies I song certain AV aamese, Filipin & examine birth ase of BCS. AAF de to non-Hispa aldviduals are	d lov and PI w cetty haw API o, C hpla PIs a mic at r us ABS Bac	Ann Butt TRACT Skground We	EFFECT OF LEGISLATIVE OF BREAST-CONS Ler Nattinger, M.D., M.P.H., Rayme Mark S. Gottler, Ph.D., a studied the effect of state legis-	Article REQUIREMENTS ON THE USE ERVING SURGERY OND G. HOFFMANN, Ph.D., ROBYN SHAPBO, J.D., ND JAMES S. GOOWN, M.D. actions on the part of health care providers. Tradi- tionally, legislation of this type has been restricted to public health measures, such as the reporting of cas-		to		try were compared. A previous Patient tomy with radiation therapy was an effec- Care Evaluation study by the Commission tit substitute for mastectomy in the treat- ment of early stage (0, 1, 11) breast cancer (-1 The rapid) changing concerts and there are reasons why some patients the surgical treatment of breast cancer of fered an opportunity to investigate regional and physicians might favor one treatment variations, specifically with respect to the use of partial mastectomy. Although the substitute of master are individual choices would result in differences in regional be- mastectomy. Although the substitution of partial mastectomy and radiation therapy for total mastectomy and radiation therapy for total mastectomy and radiation therapy therapy for total treatment of breast cancer.
	British Journal of Cancer (2005) 92, 55–59 @2005 Cancer Research UK All rights reserved 0007–09	\$30.00	we ment	of breast cance	disclosure of options for the treat- er on the use of breast-conserving	es of infectious diseases, but mor	re recently it h	ias		Dr. Osteen is Vice Chairman of the Department of Surgery at the Brigham and Women's Hospi- tal in Reston. Methods
www.bjancer.com			surgery in clinical practice. Methods The National Cancer Institute's Surveil- lance, Epidemiology, and End Results registry pro- vided data on women from 30 through 79 years of age who underwent breast-conserving surgery or mastectomy for local or regional breast cancer from			been applied to other kinds of me as the care of patients with the acq ficiency syndrome. Several state laws with the aim of promoting breas gery for women with breast cancer	uired immunod s have been pass st-conserving su r in an early stag	le- ed 1r- ge.	02; 72: 708-715	
Case-mix fails to explain variation in mastectomy rates: management of screen-detected breast cancer in a UK region			1983	through 1990. \	We examined the trend over time t-conserving surgery among pa-	The enactment of such legislation provides an op- portunity to examine the effectiveness of legislative				
I 997-2003			tients Utah quiri breas (Detr such	s in four sites) where there w ng the disclosur st cancer by phy oit, Atlanta, Ne legislation, we	(Connecticut, Iowa, Seattle, and vere no state laws specifically re- re of options for the treatment of ysicians. For four additional sites w Mexico, and Hawaii) that had determined whether the rate of	imandares in altering medical practice. By 1985, several randomized trials had demon- strated the efficacy of breast-conserving surgery. ⁷¹⁰ but the use of this treatment in clinical practice in- creased only minimally during the late 1980s. ¹¹¹³				AL MANAGEMENT OF DUCTAL CARCINOMA <i>IN SITU</i> IN AUSTRALIA IN 1995
¹ Ansteinic Suppol Changley, Urb, Existen of Suppol Sensore (Supp), Section of Suppol & Ansteinker Sciences, The University of Subplice (Exist, Negel Halmannin Instepat), degline 100 (2), Kir (Subol U Hanhan and Relater disearch, Shiffeld Hanhan Einsmannia Gang, SHRR University of Sheffeld Kenger Gaus, 30 Regent S, Sheffeld K 140), UK, ² East Mélonde Breat Sciencing Quelty Assumos Refinines Centre, Refferd Word, Nettragham City Handland Relation, National Relation, Sheffeld Kenger Gaus, 30 Regent S, Sheffeld Hanhan All Kenger Gaus, Sheffeld Hanhan Al				rent from the e: <i>ults</i> An attorn direction to p awaii, Georgia, st-conserving su	ey rated the legislation as giving hysicians in Michigan, followed , and New Mexico. The rate of urgery was up to 8.7 percent high-	the identification of nonclinical fac use (such as geographic location an njtal) ^{14,15} raised the question wheth breast cancer are adequately infor therapeutic options. By 1990, 18 states had passed la	AND DAVID J. HILL ¹ ter all women with rmed about their ch in Cancer, Cancer Control Research, University of Tasmania, Hobart, Tasmania, ³ Centre for Br ch in Cancer, Cancer Control Research Institute, The Cancer Council Victoria, Carlton, ¹ Department			Population Health Research, University of Tasmania, Hobart, Tasmania, ³ Centre for Behavioural Cancer Control Research Institute, The Cancer Council Victoria, Carlton, ¹ Department of Surgery,
dem case anal grac The peri vari (P< inor scree prol Briti Pub	variation in the surgical management of brast caucer exists at hospital, regional, rational and interm instate whether variation in surgical paralice obstronet at surgestel evel between break units pensits following mix, individual patient-level data from the Trent Breast Screening Programme Quelly Assurance database (1) end Expected caesers insighted matcheory natives were developed by logistic regression using the variables turno patient age and year of presentation, employing the region's overall caeser-inic adjusted paralice as the reflere region's II brasts corresing units detected 500 (298) insues/surgical ymarging of primary brast cancers. A A total of 1828 mattectomies (1%) were performed (% rate 35.8%, 75%) confidence interval. 345–351 in in matcheomy rates were observed to expected unit mastectomy rate coefficient's demonstrated overall (no sing to almost 50-40%) variation in cancers less than 15 mm dimeter (range 0.55–1.59). Significant variatios science inclusive for the second size of the second size of the research is required to investigate poter science inclusive for the splaying by caesers in sequence is the second of the second size of the second size and science in calculative factors. Journel of Cancer (2005) 20 , 55–55–56. doi:10.1038/jbjc.6602264 www.bjancer.com bid coline 21 December 2005).	ustment for -2003) was ize, site and population. the 6-year . Significant adjustment 0.66-1.36), surgery for	er than expected in Detroit for six months after the passage of the Michigan law (P<0.01). The rate was up to 13.2 percent higher than expected in Hawaii for 12 months after that state's law was passed (P<0.05) and up to 6.0 percent higher than expected in Atlanta for 3 months after the passage of the Georgia law (P<0.01). After these transient increases, the surgery rates reverted to the expected levels. No significant effect was detected in New Mexico, where only a res- olution without legal force was passed. <i>Conclusions</i> Legislation requiring physicians to disclose options for the transmert affect on the rate of use of breast-conserving surgery. (N Engl			By 1990, 18 states had passed 1a dressing the disclosure by physical the treatment of breast cancer. ¹⁶ W fect of such legislation on the use 4- ing surgery in clinical practice. METHODS Sources of Data The National Cancer Institute's formed and find Results (SEER) registry data has the clinical data we studied. The data we geographical distinct, population-based tu clude information on patients' demograph extent of disease, and initial treatment for 1	ns of options for e assessed the ef- f breast-conserv- in Australia in 1995. This representative, national data set provides a historical comparator for studies exat ent that follow. Surgeons identified by population-based cancer registries as having treated a new diagnosis of DCIS bet typember 1995 completed a questionnaire on the presentation and management of each case. Two hundred and five surgeons supplied treatment details on 418 DCIS tumours in 415 women. Half of all t the results of the surgeons is a strained to the surgeons details of the surgeons and the surgeons applied treatment details on 418 DCIS tumours in 415 women. Half of all t the results of the surgeons supplied treatment details on 418 DCIS tumours in 415 women. Half of all t the results of the surgeons supplied treatment details on 418 DCIS tumours in 415 women. Half of all t and the association of the treat-stype were detected at other manography centres. Twenty-six precise able at presentation, 33% were multified and 55% were the high grade (including comedocarcinoma). Breast BCT) rather than mastectomy was utilized in 260 (62%) of cases. Tumours that were of low grade, small in the oursement of the treater by BCT. Surgeons success in the 6-month period were for the success of the surgeons supplied treates and the surgeons in the surgeons in the surgeons in the for were for the surgeons the surgeons and the surgeons are period. The surgeons success for the surgeons the surgeons are supplied to the surgeons the surgeons are period. The surgeons success for the for more for the surgeons the surgeons are period. The surgeons success in the 6-month period were the surgeons are the surgeons and the surgeons are period. The surgeons success for the surgeons the surgeons the surgeons are period. The surgeons success in the 6-month period were the surgeons are period. The surgeons success for the surgeons the surgeons the surgeons the surgeons the surgeons are period. The surgeons success for the 6-month period were the surgeons the fort the sur			resent paper we describe the presentation and management of ductal carcinoma in <i>situ</i> (DCIS) of the breast 1995. This representative, national data set provides a historical comparator for studies examining DCIS entified by population-based cancer registries as having treated a new diagnosis of DCIS between 1 April ompleted a questionnaire on the presentation and management of each case. and five surgeons supplied treatment details on 418 DCIS humours in 415 women. Half of all tumours were clinics and a further 25% were detected at other mammography centres. Twenty-six precent of tumours ation, 33% were multifocal and 55% were high grade (including comedocarcinoma). Breast conserving in mastectomy was utilized in 260 (62%) of cases. Tumours that were of low grade, small in size and not by to be treated by BCT. Surgeons seeing six or more DCIS cases in the 6-month period were more likely to
e 200 cake reservo or restectory, szeering auśt variation, case-rik adjustnent			J Me	d 1996;335:103 , Massachusetts Me	5-40.)	cent of disease, and initial relativity of a cent of the patients with cancer in the Unit the SEER data base included the entire s Hawaii, Iowa, New Mexico, and Utah and t	he United States. The sites in entire states of Connecticit.			astectomy were that the tumour was too extensive or multifocal (63%), it extended to margins of the speci-





Why does treatment vary?











Decision-making approaches

You will be having ...



Paternalistic

16/02/2012 © The University of Sheffield









Why give choices?

- No 'best' treatment
- Patients' treatment preferences vary
- When provided with information & allowed to play the role they want in treatment selection patients
 - are more satisfied
 - have less regret about their treatment
 - make a better psychological recovery



Research project overview







British Journal of Surgery 2008; 95: 312-318

It is not the cancers Clinicians' preferences vary Women want more say in decisions

		-			
Biritids Journal of Cancer (2005) 92, 55–59 6 205 Cancer Research UK: All rights reserved 0007–095065 \$3000 www.bjcancer.com		to	ROTEAN JURNAL OF CANCER 43 (2007) 2562-2669 available at www.sciencedirect.com	Original article Changing trends in the decision-making preferences of women with early breast cancer	
Case-mix fails to explain variation in mastectomy rates: management of screen-detected breast cancer in a UK region 1997–2003	53		Journal homepage: www.ejconline.com	L. J. M. Caldon ¹ , S. J. Walters ² and M. W. R. Reed ¹ ¹ Academic Unic of Surgical Oxology, School of Medicine and Biomedical Sciences, and ¹ Medical Susinisis Group, School of Health and Related Research, University of Schrifteld, Schrifteld, UK <i>Correspondents at:</i> Mins L J. M. Caldon, Academic Unic of Surgical Oncology, The University of Schrifteld, K Floor, School of Medicine and Biomed Sciences, Reech Hill Road, Schrifteld S10 (20X, UK (e-mail Laddon0bhdfield.ac.uk)	
LJM Caldon ¹ , SJ Walters ² , JA Reed ³ , A Murphy ³ , A Worley ³ and MWR Reed ^{6,1} Azalemic Spricel Oxolog: Uni: Dison of Spricel Sciences South, Section of Spricel & Anosotheic Sciences. The University of Sheffeld. Roor K, Rayal Hollomother Hospital, Speffeld SI 02, FC, K ² Shoul of Hostin A Research, Sheffeld Hosth Economics Gough, SH4RQ. University of Sheffeld, Report, Core, JD Report, SS Speffeld SI 40, UC: Star Midoral Benezin Sciencing Qualty Assurance References Center, Reford Word Nettingham City Hospital NHS Trace, Huckowal Rood, Natargham NGS 1/B, LK:	Clinical Studie	⁴ Academic Surgical Oncology Unit, The U ^b Medical Statistics Group, School of Healt	n J. Wolters ^b , Julie Ratcliffe ⁶ , Malcohm W.R. Reed ^a briovrzhy of Suffield, Floor R. bysł Hillendelse Henrich, Suffield SD 27, UK nard Related Brearch, University of Suffield, Bayers Court, 30 Report Street, Suffield SI 4DA, UK 8 of Health and Related Research, University of Sheffield, Bayers Court, 30 Report Street,	Background: Previous studies have indicated a predominance of passive decision-making styles among women with early-stage breast cancer in the UK offered a choice between breast-conserving surgery (BCS) and mastectomy. The sim of this study was to determine current decision-making styles and crstabilish their association with operiodic obies and breast unit mastectomy rate. Methods: A questionnaire survey was conducted among women from three specialist breast units representing high, medium and low case mix-adjusted matectomy rates.	
de vanistion in the surgical management of breast cancer oxists at hospital, regional, national and international level. To monstrate whether vanision in surgical practice observed at agregate hered between breast units prosists following advantment for newice individual patient-bread datas from the Tirent Breast Strenging Programme Quality Assurance database (1997–2003) was lyind. Expected cause-mix adjuncted materiatory networks delived by logifics: regression using the vanishes terminor take, and and da, patient age and your of presentation, employing the region's overall cause-mix adjusted paracles and the reference population data. The start screening units detected 5100 (1998) manakes) auguidal pranaged paracy breast cancers over the 6-year toda. A total of 1828 materiesamics (MV) were performed (MV rate SSB, 758, conditiones straval; 245–377, 153), Significant traits in materiatory takes were doeveed between units (regions <u>2</u> –458, P. 2000), and prestis biblioning cause-mix adjustement		A & T I C L E I N F O Article kinnyr: Received 18 Deamber 2006 Received in revised form 14 March 2007 Acrepted 20 April 2007 Avuilable online 6 June 2007	A 8 5 T R A C T Introduction: Little is known regarding cancer clinicians' treatment preferences. Airs: Determine the impact of pre-operative variables over specialist breast clinicians' operative preferences using discrete choice experiment methodology. Methods: Crass-sectional survey of operative preferences to hypothetical scenarios based ore, patient age, bro cay pira, cancer its; site and focults' Renalis: 735s response rate (40293). Multisemial logistic regression across scenarios (n=1695) with allowance for response clustering, comparing eval preference for mater-	Besuffit: Of 497 consecutive patients, 356 (51-1 per cent) completed the questionnity, a mean of 6-9 (rung, 1-3-48-6) weeks after surgery. Some 2d2 women (7-5-per cent) underwent IRS and 94 (26-4 per cent) had a mastectomy. Sense 218 patients (61-2 per cent) achieved their preferred decision-making uptle. The proportional dynomena schwing an article decision-making there this physical transformation of the sense of	
(P < 10001) Two-fold variation in observed to expected unit matterbory rate coefficient is demonstrated overall (ange 0.64–1.36), increasing to almost found/of variation in carcers less than 15 mm dameter (range 0.55–1.55), galinitar variation is augrey for screen-detected primary breast cancers is not explained by case mix. Further research is required to investigate potential patient and professional cascular feators. Brish Journal of Corree (2005) 12 , 55–59, doi:10.1038/jbjc.6602264 www.bjcuncer.com Published online 12 Desember 2004		Keywords: Breast cancer Mastectomy Treatment: variation Discrete choice experiment	(re 1009) with anomator in response culturing, Comparing equa presenters in matter- tioning and Teerst construction suppring IGSs with preferences for matterious prob- ling of the start age, curves size, extrain list, multi-fociality and reducing cup size, all anomatoria with preference for matteriotengy, over equal preference, over BSG 60-0001, Doctors preferred specific treatments, females and sumes avoided matteriotmy (p=0.015 and p=0.001 respectively).	Presented in part to the BJS prize session of the Annual Scientific Meeting of the British Association of Surgical Oncology - the Association for Cancer Surgery, London, UK, November 2000, and published in abstract form as Ear J Surg Orkol 2006, 32500, pp. 1028 Paper accepted 22 August 2007 Published online 13-Sestember 2007 in Wiler InterScience few whisco.ukb. DOI: 10.1002/tis.5964	

Conclusions: Clinician preferences were predominantly treatment guideline congruent, but

significantly influenced by patient age, clinician gender and occupation. This methodology

is capable of elucidating treatment preferences and could be applied elsewhere where

treatment options and practice variability exist.

Copyright © 2007 British Journal of Surgery Society Ltd Published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd

Stated preference

Professional preference

© 2005 Cancer Research UK

Keywords: breast cancer; mastectomy; screening; audit; variation; case-mix adjustment





What about the patients?

...Do women want to choose their operation?







Patient survey

- Sample (n=365/697)
 - Patients from 3 Breast Units: high, medium & low Mx rates
 - Purposive sampling: women given a choice of surgery
- **Questionnaire** 2 validated tools
 - Decision-making styles Strull et al. 1984, Degner et al. 1997
- Data analysis
 - Frequency, Chi-square, One way ANOVA SPSS version 12.0





Decision-making styles



*1990s

> 50% women wanted decisions making for them Now **

> 80% wanted to participate in treat decisions



- ~30% Collaborative
- < 20% Passive
- ~20% Active > 40% Active

Women choosing mastectomy were the most active decision-makers 83% vs. 58% p<0.001

*Degner & Sloan 1992 & 1997, Beaver et al 1996

** Caldon et al. 2008



...but what happens in practice? Who determines the treatment?







Semi-structured interviews

- Sample
 - 3 Breast Units: high, medium & low Mx rates
 - Specialist doctors & nurses (n=29)
 - Patients: purposive sampling given a choice (n=65)
- Data
 - Interviews recorded & transcribed verbatim
- Data analysis 'Framework' approach
 - Rigorous, systematic, comprehensive





Treatment variation themes

Low MR unit

- Ethos of conservation
- Active direction of choice
 - Less comprehensive, more directive information
 - More recommendations
- Less support of autonomous patient decision-making
- Time pressure for decision-making
- ('Informed') compliance

Medium and high MR units

- Ethos of choice
- Reluctance to direct choice
 - More comprehensive, less directive information
 - Less recommendations
- Active support of autonomous patient decision-making
- Lack of time pressure
- Shared decision making (informed consent)





Skewed power relationship







Skewed power relationship

...which can be exaggerated





"...personally ...l've always tried to conserve breasts ... I find the concept of open choice when it's perfectly possible to do a simple breast conserving operation ...giving the same results as mastectomy ...quite peculiar..."

"...Mr___ said to me, and I will never forget this, 'I don't like doing mastectomies' ... it really upsets him ... So ...there was no discussion ...he really wasn't listening to what I was saying..."



Preference mismatch







Skewed power relationship

...which can be exaggerated







Skewed power relationship

... or ameliorated by the decision-making environment









What can/should be done?



Recipe









- Define the 'correct' mastectomy rate, or an acceptable range?
- Should patients only have mastectomy if conservation is contraindicated?









- If patient choice paramount?
 - Improved awareness & identification of preferences
 - Tailor decision-making
 - Communication skills training
 - Methods to empower patient decision-making









Treatment decision-making variation is

- Not due to the cancers (Br J Cancer 2005; 92(1): 55-9)
- Associated with clinician preferences (Eur J Cancer 2007;43(11):1662-9)
- Associated with patients being more or less active in their roles in choosing treatments (Br J Surgery 2008; 95(3): 312-8)
- **Predominantly** dependant on patients' understanding of clinicians' preference (Br J Cancer 2011; 104: 1551-7)



Funding Cancer Research UK The Royal College of Surgeons of England

Trent Breast Units Barnsley District General Hospital Bassetlaw District General Hospital Chesterfield Royal Hospital Derby City General Hospital Doncaster Royal Infirmary Glenfield General Hospital Grantham & District General Hospital Kings Mill Hospital Lincoln County Hospital Nottingham City Hospital Pilgrim Hospital Rotherham District General Hospital Sheffield Teaching Hospitals

Trent region's patients





Thank you

The research team University of Sheffield Lisa Caldon Sam Ahmedzai Bill Noble Stephen Walters David Wilde

Sheffield Hallam University Karen Collins

Consumer representatives Hazel Marshall-Cork Gillian Speed

East midlands QA (formerly Trent QA) Jacquie Reed Alison Murphy Anne Worley



